

REVIEWER CHECKLIST

REVIEWER: Matt Wedel

AUTHOR(S): **Daniel J. Taylor**

TITLE: [Sauropods of the Mesozoic Era](#)

REQUESTED RETURN DATE: **2/1/05**

REVIEW GUIDELINES -- Please consider the following in your review:

- 1) Is the title adequate? Heck, it's comprehensive!
- 2) Is the abstract concise and informative? Yes.
- 3) Are there errors of fact or interpretation? Not that I can see.
- 4) Has the material been published previously? If so in what form? No.
- 5) Does the author show adequate awareness of previous work in the field and an adequate knowledge of pertinent literature?

The author has failed to mention *Sauroposeidon* or cite the numerous important papers by Wedel (2003a,b, 2004, 2005a,b), Wedel and Cifelli (2005), Wedel and Sanders (2002), Wedel et al. (2000a,b), or Bonnan and Wedel (2004).

- 6) Are the citations correct and appropriate? Except for the glaring errors outlined above, yes.
- 7) Is the author accurate when discussing the opinions of other workers? Yes.
- 8) Are adequate comparisons made with similar forms? Are the significant differences of new forms indicated? Is a repository indicated? Are the rules of nomenclature followed?

I was a bit troubled by one aspect of the paper. It's by a Briton and it's two pages long, so the failure to erect at least two new sauropod taxa based on utterly unidentifiable scraps of fossilized whale dung is inexplicable. Perhaps the author is experimenting with a new form of scientific paper.

- 9) Is the locality and other geographic information adequate? Yes.
- 10) Are the figures and photographs clear and suitably arranged? Very.
- 11) Could this paper (text or plates) be condensed by a significant amount? If so please indicate how.

On the contrary, I think this could easily be expanded to monograph length.

After considering the above questions, please fill out and return the reviewer's comment sheet provided on Page 2. Please attach additional sheets. Comments may also be penciled in the margins of the paper (please print).

THANK YOU.

65(2):40-57.

11. Wedel, M.J. 2005b. Postcranial skeletal pneumaticity in sauropods and its implications for mass estimates; pp. 201-228 in Wilson, J.A., and Curry-Rogers, K. (eds.), *The Sauropods: Evolution and Paleobiology*. University of California Press, Berkeley.

Signature Matt Wedel

(Please sign only if you wish for your name to appear on the review)