



SEARCH



ABQjournal requires a paid subscription.

This story is available free without registration.

- [Subscribers register now.](#)
- [Or subscribe to the Albuquerque Journal newspaper.](#)
- [Archives and Journal Library](#)

[Front Page](#) ▶ [news](#) ▶ [state](#)

Friday, February 8, 2008

Museum Ethics Spat May Get New Review

By [John Fleck](#)

Copyright © 2008 Albuquerque Journal; Journal Staff Writer

Faced with growing criticism nationally, the head of New Mexico's Department of Cultural Affairs on Thursday acknowledged the state's response to scientific ethics complaints against the head of the New Mexico Museum of Natural History and Science has been insufficient.

Stuart Ashman said he is considering a new review into allegations against acting Museum Director Spencer Lucas in the face of a growing controversy that included:

- The Society of Vertebrate Paleontology— the professional organization for those who study fossils— said this week that its ethics committee is undertaking a formal investigation.
- A world-renowned paleontologist described the response as "stonewalling."

Critics have accused Lucas of publishing their ideas under his own name in a scientific bulletin put out by the museum— which they say lacks the rigorous peer review of other publications and gives him an unfair advantage.

The complaint with the highest profile involves a dispute over who should have received credit for the naming of an alligator-like fossil found in northern New Mexico.

Lucas has denied he acted improperly, and Ashman previously said an investigation last year found the charges "without merit."

Albuquerque's Premiere Hair Transplant Specialist
Artistry - Technology - Experience

"I know I can help you"

Story Tools

[E-mail Story](#)

[Print Friendly](#)

[Send E-mail](#)

[To John Fleck](#)

[By Recent stories](#)

[by John Fleck](#)

[NewsLibrary](#)

[Archives search](#)

[for John Fleck](#)

['95-now](#)

[Reprint story](#)

Save & Share

[Tag this Page](#)

[Powered by Del.icio.us](#)

Most Requested

1 [Freebies are](#)

[Providing the](#)

[Kicks at Route 66](#)

2 [Museum Guide](#)

3 [Tempe](#)

[Businessman](#)

[Accused of Super](#)

[Bowl Plot](#)

Most E-mailed

1 [Jury Awards](#)

[\\$33 Million In](#)

[Lawyer Fight](#)

2

[Clinton-Obama](#)

[Count](#)

[Continues](#)

3 [Water Not](#)

[Wanted In](#)

[Duke City](#)

Who's Blogging?

Read what's being written about Albuquerque Journal reports.

COLLEGE GOAL SUNDAY Need Help Paying for College?

FREE FINANCIAL AID WORKSHOP

SATURDAY, FEBRUARY 23, 2008
CLOVIS GALLUP LOS LUNAS PORTALES

SUNDAY, FEBRUARY 24, 2008
ALBUQUERQUE BELEN CARLSBAD ESPANOLA FARMINGTON GADSDEN HOBBS LAGUNA LAS CRUCES ROSWELL SANTA TERESA

ATTEND FOR A CHANCE TO WIN A \$500 SCHOLARSHIP!

www.collegegoalnm.org
CLICK FOR LOCATIONS AND TIMES

But amid growing criticism from some members of the scientific community, Ashman told the Journal on Thursday that he is considering asking for another review.

The charges involve allegations that New Mexico Museum of Natural History and Science researchers, led by Lucas, used a museum publication to short-circuit the normal scientific peer review process.

The critics charge that Lucas and his colleagues used the museum publications, which have minimal outside review and can be published more quickly than conventional peer-reviewed scientific journals, to snatch away and claim credit for ideas originally developed by others.

Lucas could not be reached for comment Thursday, but, in an interview last week, he denied the allegations.

Credit for being first with ideas is important to scientific careers, according to Janet Stemwedel, who teaches scientific ethics at San Jose State University.

She called the facts of the case, as presented publicly in discussions among paleontologists, "appalling," and said in a telephone interview that the alleged behavior of Lucas and his colleagues threatens the cooperative sense of community necessary for science to succeed.

Kevin Padian, a world-renowned paleontologist at the University of California, Berkeley, said New Mexico state officials owe the scientists involved a more thorough explanation than a two-word statement that the charges are "without merit."

"This is not good for our field. It's not good for the museum," Padian said in a telephone interview.

Padian was careful to note that he does not know whether Lucas's critics are correct. Padian and Lucas attended graduate school together and have known each other for 30 years, he noted. But he said that, in fairness to all the scientists involved, the issue deserves a more public airing.

"I must admit there are some things I don't understand about this affair, and it makes the present stonewalling inexplicable to me, as it is worrisome to many graduate students and younger workers," Padian wrote in an online posting outlining his views.

Ashman, in a telephone interview Thursday, said he was sympathetic to Padian's concerns. "I agree that saying 'no merit' is not enough of an answer," he said.

Ashman originally investigated the issue in June

- ▶ [American Street](#) links to [home page](#)
- ▶ [AltBrothers — A Black Gay Man Living, Loving and Laboring for a Better World](#) links to [home page](#)
- ▶ [Sierra Club](#) links to [Leave No N.M. Child Inside](#)
- ▶ [The \(New\) Outdoor Pressroom](#) links to [NM: Crushing Storm](#)
- ▶ [Errors of Enchantment, weblog of The Rio Grande Foundation](#) links to [Opinion: Hasty Water Policy Needs Second Look](#)
- ▶ [Washington Wire - WSJ.com](#) links to [m-pyre](#) links to [NM: Caucus Voting Becomes 'Chaos'](#)
- ▶ [The Page - by Mark Halperin - TIME](#) links to [NM: Clinton-Obama Count Continues](#)
- ▶ [The Reptipage: A Site Devoted to Reptiles](#) links to [Metro: Museum Boss Faces Ethics Charge](#)
- ▶ [DownWithTyranny!](#) links to [NM: Clinton-Obama Count Continues](#)

[Full list and what they're blogging](#)



New Mexico

[Around New Mexico](#)

[Many in N.M. Anticipating Wet Rivers](#)

[Elk Herds Must Have Gotten Word Taos Is Tourist-Friendly](#)

[Appeals Court Strikes Down Relaxed Power Plant Emissions Policy](#)

[Tempe Businessman Accused of Super Bowl Plot](#)

[State, Feds Reach Accord Over Nuclear Waste Sent to WIPP](#)

[Charge Reduced Against Farmington Teen](#)

[Democrats Set Rules for Qualifying, Counting Provisional Ballots](#)

[Bears' Urlacher Has Minor Neck Surgery](#)

[Man Indicted in Killing of Ruidoso Woman](#)

[Deal Trims Nuclear Waste Fine](#)

[Bill Would Honor Vets of Bataan](#)

[Driver May Face 11th DWI](#)

[More New Mexico](#)

and concluded that the charges had no basis.

When Lucas' critics persisted, Ashman raised the issue again with the museum board's executive committee in September. They also reviewed the complaints and concluded they were without merit, according to executive committee member Peter Gerity.

But Gerity and Ashman say there is no written record documenting the investigation and conclusion.

"There isn't," Ashman said Thursday. "There should be."

Padian called the lack of any sort of formal accounting of the state's inquiries into the charges "puzzling."

"It's not the sort of thing that you expect from a public institution," he said.

Ashman said he is considering asking the museum board's executive committee to convene again to look into the case and create a more formal record of its review.

Padian offered praise for the Museum of Natural History. "It's got a very strong program of research and public education," he said.

That is why, he said, a more open inquiry is so important.

"There's a cloud out there now," Padian said. "The cloud is over the museum."

In addition to Ashman's comments, the Society of Vertebrate Paleontology's executive committee issued a statement saying the organization is investigating. The statement said the organization would not release any information or discuss the case publicly until the review is completed.

[Latest Albuquerque and New Mexico News](#)

[Rules Tossed to Speed Count](#)

[Caucus Winner Gains Little](#)

[Cops Vow to Stop 'Fight Club'](#)

[Sports](#)

[Scorpions Drub Visiting Rayz](#)

[Edgewood's Travis Briscoe Feels Family, Return to N.M. Have Much to Do With Success](#)

[Fast Pace Expected for NMSU-Boise State](#)

[Lobos, Cowboys to Vie in 1st MWC Rematch](#)

[Bonuses Totaling \\$343k Paid to 32 Athletics Staffers Last Year](#)

[Lobo Gary an Impact Freshman](#)

[UNM Promotes Reffett to 'D' Coordinator](#)

[Fans Weigh in on What They'd Like to See and Hear](#)

[2003 Truly Was a Banner Recruiting Year](#)

[BOXING Holm Wins by a Unanimous Decision](#)



[Where can I buy a newspaper?](#) | [E-mail this Story](#) | [Printer Friendly](#)
[front page](#) | [news](#) | [business](#) | [sports](#) | [go](#) | [weather](#) | [science](#) | [classifieds](#) | [archive](#) | [arts](#)
[movies](#) | [tv](#) | [jobs](#) | [site map](#) | [search](#)

[Privacy Policy & Copyright © 1997 - 2008 Albuquerque Journal: Albuquerque, New Mexico](#)
 Call the Journal: 505-823-3800 | Weatherline: 821-1111 | Place an ad: 505-823-4444

[Albuquerque Journal Subscriber Services](#)

[Submit a news tip](#) | [Place a classified ad](#) | [Advertise Online at ABQjournal](#) | [Advertise in Albuquerque Journal print products](#) | [Subscribe to newspaper](#)

Save & Share [Tag this Page](#) | Powered by [Del.icio.us](#) [...go to bookmarks](#)
[back to top](#)