REVIEWER CHECKLIST

REVIEWER: Matt Wedel AUTHOR(S): **Daniel J. Taylor**

TITLE: Sauropods of the Mesozoic Era

REQUESTED RETURN DATE: 2/1/05

REVIEW GUIDELINES -- Please consider the following in your review:

1) Is the title adequate? Heck, it's comprehensive!

2) Is the abstract concise and informative? Yes.

3) Are there errors of fact or interpretation? Not that I can see.

4) Has the material been published previously? If so in what form? No.

5) Does the author show adequate awareness of previous work in the field and an adequate knowledge of pertinent literature?

The author has failed to mention *Sauroposeidon* or cite the numerous important papers by Wedel (2003a,b, 2004, 2005a,b), Wedel and Cifelli (2005), Wedel and Sanders (2002), Wedel et al. (2000a,b), or Bonnan and Wedel (2004).

6) Are the citations correct and appropriate? Except for the glaring errors outlined above, yes.

7) Is the author accurate when discussing the opinions of other workers? Yes.

8) Are adequate comparisons made with similar forms? Are the significant differences of new forms indicated? Is a repository indicated? Are the rules of nomenclature followed?

I was a bit troubled by one aspect of the paper. It's by a Briton and it's two pages long, so the failure to erect at least two new sauropod taxa based on utterly unidentifiable scraps of fossilized whale dung is inexplicable. Perhaps the author is experimenting with a new form of scientific paper.

9) Is the locality and other geographic information adequate? Yes.

10) Are the figures and photographs clear and suitably arranged? Very.

11) Could this paper (text or plates) be condensed by a significant amount? If so please indicate how.

On the contrary, I think this could easily be expanded to monograph length.

After considering the above questions, please fill out and return the reviewer's comment sheet provided on Page 2. Please attach additional sheets. Comments may also be penciled in the margins of the paper (please print).

THANK YOU.

REVIEWER'S COMMENTS

Reviewer: AUTHORS: **Daniel J. Taylor** TITLE: <u>Sauropods of the Mesozoic Era</u>

This paper is acceptable,	as it stands	X	after minor revision
	after major revision		is not acceptable

Strong points: very well written. "In between the times 1742 and 1980 the true answer to the way they mated was ridiculously unknown to our planet," may be the best thing anyone has ever said in English. The illustration is very clear, also.

Weak points: in addition to not citing Wedel (2000, 2003a,b, 2004, 2005a,b), Wedel and Cifelli (2005), Wedel and Sanders (2002), Wedel et al. (2000a,b), or Bonnan and Wedel (2004), the author did not thank Wedel, who, like Darren, has visited the author and shared his knowledge of sauropods (pers. obs.).

Verdict: despite some problems, the paper is important and timely and I recommend publication with minor revision.

Papers cited in this review, by publication order:

- 1. Wedel, M.J., Cifelli, R.L., and Sanders, R.K. 2000a. *Sauroposeidon proteles*, a new sauropod from the Early Cretaceous of Oklahoma. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 20(1):109-114.
- 2. Wedel, M.J., Cifelli, R.L., and Sanders, R.K. 2000b. Osteology, paleobiology, and relationships of the sauropod dinosaur *Sauroposeidon*. Acta Palaeontologica Polonica 45(4):343-388.
- 3. Wedel, M.J. 2000. Reconstructing *Brachiosaurus*. Prehistoric Times 42:47.
- 4. Wedel, M.J., and Sanders, R.K. 2002. Osteological correlates of cervical musculature in Aves and Sauropoda (Dinosauria: Saurischia), with comments on the cervical ribs of *Apatosaurus*. PaleoBios 22(3):1-6.
- 5. Wedel, M.J. 2003a. Vertebral pneumaticity, air sacs, and the physiology of sauropod dinosaurs. Paleobiology 29(2):243-255.
- 6. Wedel, M.J. 2003b. The evolution of vertebral pneumaticity in sauropod dinosaurs. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 23(2):344-357.
- Wedel, M.J. 2004. The origin of postcranial skeletal pneumaticity in dinosaurs. Proceedings of the 19th International Congress of Zoology, Beijing, China Zoological Society:443-445.
- 8. Bonnan, M.F., and Wedel, M.J. 2004. First occurrence of *Brachiosaurus* (Dinosauria: Sauropoda) from the Upper Jurassic Morrison Formation of Oklahoma. PaleoBios 24(2):13-21.
- 9. Wedel, M.J. 2005a. A little local color: the giant dinosaur *Sauroposeidon*. Oklahoma Geology Notes 65(2):38.
- 10. Wedel, M.J., and Cifelli, R.L. 2005. Sauroposeidon: Oklahoma's native giant. Oklahoma Geology Notes

65(2):40-57.

 Wedel, M.J. 2005b. Postcranial skeletal pneumaticity in sauropods and its implications for mass estimates; pp. 201-228 in Wilson, J.A., and Curry-Rogers, K. (eds.), *The Sauropods: Evolution and Paleobiology*. University of California Press, Berkeley.

Signature <u>Matt Wedel</u>

(Please sign only if you wish for your name to appear on the review)